United Nations A/HRC/32/7

General Assembly

Distr.: General
12 April 2016

Original: English

Human Rights Council
Thirty-second session
Agenda item 6
Universal periodic review

Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review*

Estonia

* The annex is being circulated in the language of submission only.

GE.16-05966(E)

Please recycle

Contents

		Page
	Introduction	3
I.	Summary of the proceedings of the review process	3
	A. Presentation by the State under review	3
	B. Interactive dialogue and responses by the State under review	5
II.	Conclusions and/or recommendations	15
Annex		
	Composition of the delegation	27

Introduction

1. The Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, established in accordance with Human Rights Council resolution 5/1, held its twenty-fourth session from 18 to 29 January 2016. The review of Estonia was held at the 4th meeting on 19 January 2016. The delegation of Estonia was headed by the Minister of Foreign Affairs, Marina Kaljurand. At its 10th meeting held on 22 January 2016, the Working Group adopted the report on Estonia.

2. On 12 January 2016, the Human Rights Council selected the following group of rapporteurs (troika) to facilitate the review of Estonia: Burundi, Qatar and United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland.

3. In accordance with paragraph 15 of the annex to Human Rights Council resolution 5/1 and paragraph 5 of the annex to Council resolution 16/21, the following documents were issued for the review of Estonia:

(a) A national report submitted/written presentation made in accordance with paragraph 15 (a) (A/HRC/WG.6/24/EST/1);

(b) A compilation prepared by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) in accordance with paragraph 15 (b) (A/HRC/WG.6/24/EST/2);

(c) A summary prepared by OHCHR in accordance with paragraph 15 (c) (A/HRC/WG.6/24/EST/3).

4. A list of questions prepared in advance by Belgium, the Czech Republic, Germany, Mexico, the Netherlands, Norway, Spain, Sweden and the United Kingdom was transmitted to Estonia through the troika. These questions are available on the extranet of the universal periodic review.

I. Summary of the proceedings of the review process

A. Presentation by the State under review

5. The delegation stated that the expansion of the space for human rights, democracy, rule of law and advancement of international law remained one of the priorities of the country's foreign policy. Estonia was a party to the core international human rights conventions and the majority of regional human rights treaties, and regularly submitted its reports on their implementation.

6. Estonia remained committed to protecting and promoting human rights and fundamental freedoms at the national and international level. It had issued a standing invitation to the special procedure mandate holders of the Human Rights Council to visit the country. Estonia would continue paying special attention to ensure the involvement and participation of civil society in the work of the Council.

7. The delegation reported on the active participation of Estonia in the work of the Human Rights Council during its membership of 2013–2015. The rights of women and children, consideration of the gender perspective in conflict situations, the fight against impunity, protection of the rights of indigenous peoples, freedom of expression, including on the Internet, and non-discrimination against lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons were the focus of the work of Estonia during its membership of the Council.

8. Estonia considered the universal periodic review as an effective tool to promote human rights and to exchange best practices. Since its first review in 2011, Estonia had undertaken a coordinated effort to implement the recommendations and voluntary commitments. Estonia had implemented an overwhelming majority of the accepted recommendations, and a few of them remained in the process of implementation.

9. During the reporting period, Estonia engaged in continual cooperation with human rights bodies of the United Nations. It received several visits of the special rapporteurs of the Human Rights Council and submitted periodic reports to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, the Committee on the Rights of the Child, the Committee against Torture and the Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, as well as its common core document in 2015. In addition, the Government maintained continuing dialogue and consultations with representatives of civil society on human rights issues.

10. The delegation expressed its gratitude to all States that had submitted advance questions. It continued its statement in order to provide a response to those questions. The protection of the rights of persons belonging to national minorities remained a priority of the Government. The Estonian population comprised over 190 nationalities, and minorities constituted approximately 31 percent of the population. Estonia had been implementing its national integration programmes since 2000. The new programme for the period 2014-2020, which had been developed by taking into account new developments in society, assessments of regular monitoring and the opinions of representatives of national minorities and experts had set three main objectives, including the provision of continuing support to long-term residents belonging to national minorities to integrate them into society. The Ministry of Culture, along with several other ministries, had been responsible for the realization of the national integration policy, encompassing different areas of life. The integration monitoring survey carried out in 2014 and 2015 indicated positive results of the integration efforts.

11. The delegation reported on the launch of a new Russian-language public television channel, targeting a Russian-speaking audience and aimed at providing objective information on daily life in Estonia and helping with the integration of the Russian-speaking population in the society. Furthermore, the provision of free courses on the Estonian language was envisaged in the integration strategy to enhance the command of the state language among minorities.

12. One of the priorities of the Government was to reduce the number of persons with undetermined citizenship. The amendments to the Citizenship Act were aimed at simplifying naturalization requirements and targeted especially the children of parents with undetermined citizenship, beneficiaries of international protection and older persons. The number of persons with undetermined citizenship had decreased due to the continual efforts of the Government.

13. Estonia complied with European Union legislation related to the regulations and requirements concerning determination of refugee status, as well as the provision of legal guarantees for them. In that respect, the 2016 legal amendments would further incorporate European Union legislation.

14. Estonia took steps to improve the living conditions of asylum seekers. In 2014, an accommodation centre for asylum seekers had been moved to a new location, which was closer to public services, including education institutions, the labour market and health-care services, than the previous one. Estonia took measures to ensure that the children of newly arrived migrants, refugees or asylum seekers received adequate education. The Estonian language immersion programme had proven effective; the children of refugees who had started school in autumn 2015 already had a good command of Estonian.

15. Estonia took steps to promote tolerance and cultural diversity. Incitement to hatred, violence or discrimination was criminalized. Further improvement of the Criminal Code was envisaged. Additionally, Estonia had been continually tackling those issues through education. The general education programme for the period 2016–2019 included specific activities on human rights. Estonia had also joined the "No hate speech" initiative of the Council of Europe.

16. The delegation expressed the commitment of Estonia to promoting gender equality. The empowerment of women and their equal rights remained one of the priorities of development cooperation of Estonia. The Government had adopted the second action plan for the period 2015-2019 on the implementation of Security Council resolution 1325 (2000) on women, peace and security to improve the situation of women in conflict areas.

17. Estonia was in the process of preparing its first action plan on equality policies, including gender equality, for the period 2016–2023 in order to promote the equal participation of women in decision-making at all levels. A set of activities in various areas was envisaged to reduce the pay gap. The Government had taken special measures to address gender stereotypes as a root cause of gender inequality in general, and the gender pay gap in particular. For example, in 2013 an awareness-raising campaign had been carried out to tackle gender stereotypes. The Gender Equality Act provided legal guarantees for equal treatment of men and women in vocational education and professional training opportunities. The Government paid special attention to ensuring equal employment opportunities for men and women in institutions of higher education. The mandate of the labour inspectorate was broadened to include scrutinizing the implementation of the legal requirement of equal pay.

18. Combating domestic violence, violence against women and trafficking in persons remained a priority. Thus, the Government continued to implement, inter alia, awareness-raising campaigns and provide training and seminars for the police, prosecutors and judges.

19. The Registered Partnership Act, which had entered into force in January 2016, legalized same-sex partnership. The adoption of relevant acts for its implementation was planned for 2016.

20. The Ombudsman for Children had been established in 2011, and its duties were assigned to the Chancellor of Justice. Estonia had initiated a process of establishing an independent monitoring mechanism to implement the provisions of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, right after becoming a party to the Convention. Estonia had taken measures to reform the social welfare framework for persons with disabilities and other vulnerable groups.

21. The establishment of a national human rights institution remained under consideration by the Government. No new institution might be established, given several objective factors. The Chancellor of Justice, which was an independent institution with a mandate to receive complains and oversee the application of international human rights norms in Estonia, had been covering most of the functions of such an institution in compliance with the principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (the "Paris Principles").

B. Interactive dialogue and responses by the State under review

22. During the interactive dialogue, 73 delegations made statements. Recommendations made during the dialogue are to be found in section II of the present report.

23. The Dominican Republic noted the efforts of Estonia to adhere to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and promote the rights of women and gender equality, in particular an action plan on reducing the pay gap. It highlighted efforts to improve prison conditions and made recommendations.

24. Ecuador underscored the creation of institutions such as the Ombudsman for Children and the Gender Equality Council. Equal treatment of minorities remained a challenge. Ecuador expressed concern over the situation of persons with "undetermined citizenship". It made recommendations.

25. Egypt commended the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict, the creation of the Ombudsman for Children and efforts to combat trafficking in human beings. Egypt expressed concern about xenophobic and racist discourse in media and politics, the situation of Roma and racially motivated hate crimes, including against asylum seekers in Vao village. It made recommendations.

26. Finland noted with appreciation steps taken by Estonia to ensure the rights of children and welcomed a national strategy for Roma integration. It encouraged Estonia to adopt legislative measures and policies to provide protection against discrimination based on sexual orientation and gender identity. Finland made recommendations.

27. Morocco noted the legislative reforms regarding the rights to social security and adequate standards of living, and progress made in combating trafficking in persons. It noted with appreciation the endeavours of Estonia to protect the rights of children and measures taken to promote gender equality in education. Morocco made recommendations.

28. Georgia commended Estonia for becoming a party to several international conventions, its efforts in ensuring gender equality, the creation of the Ombudsman for Children and adoption of a child protection act. It encouraged Estonia to continue the practice of submitting midterm reports on the follow-up to the review. Georgia made recommendations.

29. Germany welcomed several steps taken to implement reforms to which Estonia had committed itself under the universal periodic review of 2011, while noting that some challenges remained. It made recommendations.

30. Ghana noted with appreciation steps taken by Estonia to establish a national human rights institute in accordance with the Paris Principles. It made recommendations.

31. Hungary welcomed the amendment to the Penal Code that included the definition of torture used in the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. It asked Estonia about further measures foreseen to effectively prevent trafficking in human beings. Hungary made recommendations.

32. Iceland commended Estonia for its efforts to better integrate ethnic and linguistic minorities. It encouraged the Government to accelerate its efforts to ensure a coherent framework for protection of persons belonging to the Russian-speaking linguistic minority. Iceland made recommendations.

33. Indonesia commended Estonia for the establishment of the Ombudsman for Children and the Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner, and for improvements to legislation in various fields, including education and trafficking in human beings. Indonesia made recommendations.

34. The Islamic Republic of Iran called on the Government to prepare a national strategy for the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. It expressed concern regarding discrimination against ethnic and religious minorities, and detainees. The Islamic Republic of Iran made recommendations.

35. Iraq acknowledged the accession of Estonia to various international human rights instruments and the important role that Estonia played during its membership of the Human Rights Council. Iraq made recommendations.

36. Ireland urged Estonia to implement fully the Registered Partnership Act and to consider ratifying the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women. It welcomed amendments to the Citizenship Act easing some requirements for naturalization. However, Ireland shared the concern of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights regarding language barriers facing the Russian-speaking minority. It made recommendations.

37. Italy welcomed the creation of the Ombudsman for Children, the Gender Equality Council and an independent monitoring mechanism of the Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Italy found the introduction of "I-voting" a very interesting tool to ensure the realization of rights not only offline but also online. Italy made recommendations.

38. Latvia noted positively the active involvement of Estonia in the work of the Human Rights Council. As a strong advocate of the universal ratification of the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, Latvia welcomed the leadership of Estonia in raising awareness of that issue in the Council. It made recommendations.

39. Libya noted positive developments since the first review of Estonia, including the standing invitation to the special procedure mandate holders of the Council and the adoption of the 2014 strategy on integration and social cohesion aimed at the effective participation of minority groups in society. Libya made recommendations.

40. Lithuania commended Estonia for the establishment of the Ombudsman for Children and the Gender Equality Council, the adoption of the Child Protection Act and the signing of the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence. Lithuania made recommendations.

41. China noted the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and other instruments, the development of an action plan to prevent violence, the adoption of a law on the protection of children and the strengthening of efforts to combat trafficking in human beings. China made recommendations.

42. Mexico welcomed the establishment of the Ombudsman for Children and the Gender Equality Council. It commended Estonia for efforts to ensure the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. Mexico made recommendations.

43. Montenegro welcomed the adoption of the Registered Partnership Act and the new Child Protection Act. It noted that Estonia had approved an action plan to reduce the gender pay gap and asked the delegation to elaborate more on the results achieved. Montenegro made recommendations.

44. France commended the adoption of the Registered Partnership Act, which was a step forward in ensuring the rights of lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender persons.

45. Namibia congratulated Estonia on the establishment of the Ombudsman for Children and the Gender Equality Council. It noted the welfare development plan for the period 2016–2023. Namibia encouraged Estonia to continue taking measures to implement an action plan to reduce the gender pay gap. It made recommendations.

46. The Netherlands commended Estonia for adopting the Registered Partnership Act, which granted legal protection to families regardless of their composition. It also noted the active role played by Estonia in the field of freedom of the media and the Internet. The Netherlands made recommendations.

47. The delegation stated that Estonia had been facing challenges related to an influx of migrants. In that context, the Government continued its efforts to tackle racism and xenophobia in society. Some public figures, including the President and the Chancellor of Justice, had taken a strong stance in the public discussion against hate speech and other forms of expression of racism and xenophobia. Due to public discussions, as well as the judgment of the European Court of Human Rights in *Delfi v. Estonia*, the acknowledgement by the media of its role and responsibilities in addressing the issue had been strengthened.

48. The Minister of Justice had held discussions and consultations with law enforcement authorities to address hate-motivated offences effectively. The Government worked constantly to improve the education system in order to tackle the manifestations of racism and xenophobia and build a human rights culture in the society.

49. Furthermore, the fight against racism and xenophobia and the integration of migrants remained at the centre of several policies, programmes and action plans. A special programme on migrants envisaged the provision of support to migrants to settle in the country. The new strategy on integration and social cohesion, entitled "Integrating Estonia 2020", addressed integration as a complex process, with an emphasis on preservation of ethnic identity and the cultures of minority groups and guarantees for their equal opportunity to participate in public life.

50. Incitement to hatred, violence or discrimination on various grounds was prohibited and punishable by law. The Minister of Justice had been drafting legal amendments to further improve the legislation on hate and racist crimes, including by incorporating racist and hate motives as aggravating circumstances. The 2015 amendments to the Criminal Code already envisaged punishment for organizations encouraging racial discrimination or violence.

51. In response to questions on prison conditions, the delegation reported that the living conditions of detainees had gradually improved owing to newly built or renovated detention facilities. The minimum requirement for living space was met at the new prisons of Viru and Tartu. The building of new premises of the Tallinn prison and detention centre had commenced. None of the old type of prison would remain by 2019, and thus all prisons would have been modernized to meet living condition standards.

52. Legal amendments prohibited overcrowding in prisons and stipulated the maximum number of prisoners each prison was permitted to accommodate. Several offences had been decriminalized and conditions for release on parole and probation had been made more flexible in 2015. Thus, the prison population was slowly decreasing due to targeted measures taken by the Government. Furthermore, the Government was carrying out a reform of the juvenile justice system to reduce the number of minors in the criminal justice system, which was already small, and ensure juveniles access to education.

53. The 2012 amendments to the Criminal Code had criminalized all elements of the specific crime of human trafficking in accordance with international law. In 2013, the Act on Victims Support had been supplemented with new provisions concerning victims of human trafficking and child victims of sexual abuse. The 2015 amendments to the Criminal Code stipulated more severe punishment for cases of domestic violence than those involving other form of violence. In 2015, Estonia had ratified the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings. In 2014, it had signed the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence.

54. Domestic violence, violence against women and trafficking in human beings remained a priority issue of the Government. A strategy for preventing violence for the period 2015-2020 put an emphasis on raising public awareness about those issues. Several training sessions and workshops for various sectors of society and professional groups,

including law enforcement agencies and judges, had been organized. By utilizing new communication and information technology, various projects had been carried out to combat trafficking in human beings.

55. Women victims of violence had been provided with State-funded shelters, covering the entire territory of Estonia and providing psychological, social and legal counselling.

56. The new development goals of Estonia were aimed at advancing the welfare and quality of life of children and their families. Among other measures, Estonia afforded generous parental benefits for the first 18 months of parental leave. However, that opportunity had mostly been used by women. Men comprised less than 10 per cent of parents who had applied for the parental leave, indicating that societal attitudes towards traditional gender roles prevailed. Nevertheless, the Government had and would continue to take measures to promote gender equality.

57. The new Child Protection Act had introduced a major reform in child protection by putting the interests of the child even further in the forefront and positioning the child as an equal member of society. The delegation reaffirmed the commitment of Estonia to ending corporal punishment and promoting positive parenting methods of child upbringing.

58. Estonia submitted its initial report to the Committee on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in 2015. The Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner would be officially designated to fulfil the duties of the independent monitoring mechanism under the Convention. The Government had been working to ensure equal access by persons with disabilities to the labour market and the provision of community-based social services to promote independent living among persons with disabilities. The 2016 Social Welfare Act would also assist in that work.

59. Nicaragua emphasized the progress achieved by Estonia in the areas of social equality, the rights of women and labour rights. It welcomed the adoption of the strategy on integration and social cohesion. Nicaragua made recommendations.

60. Norway noted the remaining challenges in relation to non-Estonian residents, especially with regard to their socioeconomic conditions. It noted with appreciation improvements in the availability of Russian-language broadcasting, amendments to the Citizenship Act that addressed some of the problems of persons without citizenship, and the adoption of the Registered Partnership Act. Norway made recommendations.

61. Oman stated that it had closely reviewed the national report of Estonia. It made recommendations.

62. Pakistan commended Estonia for its legislation strengthening the protection of human rights and its ratification of international human rights instruments. Pakistan appreciated the special care development plan, the social integration strategy, inclusive education and the Roma integration strategy. It made recommendations.

63. Panama commended the measures adopted by Estonia to combat all forms of discrimination, trafficking in persons and violence against women. It was alarmed over growing attacks and racist and xenophobic incidents directed at specific groups of the population. Panama made recommendations.

64. The Philippines noted with appreciation the ratification of several international and regional human rights treaties, including the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and its Optional Protocol. It welcomed the abolition of the death penalty and acknowledged policies and programmes of Estonia to combat trafficking in persons. The Philippines made recommendations.

65. Poland acknowledged the efforts of Estonia to comply with the recommendations accepted during the first review. Poland particularly appreciated the measures taken to

develop the institutional and legal framework for the protection of national minorities. Poland made recommendations.

66. Portugal welcomed the fact that, since its first review, Estonia had become party to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and its Optional Protocol. Portugal commended that Estonia consider establishing a national institution for the protection of human rights. Portugal made recommendations.

67. The Republic of Korea welcomed the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, the establishment of the position of the Ombudsman for Children and the Gender Equality Council and the enactment of a new Child Protection Act in 2014. It made recommendations.

68. The Republic of Moldova noted the achievements of Estonia in ensuring freedom of expression, equality and the rights of women, children and minorities. It welcomed the amendments to the Criminal Code to bring the definition of torture into compliance with the Convention against Torture and encouraged Estonia to make declarations under articles 21 and 22 of that convention. The Republic of Moldova made a recommendation.

69. Romania welcomed the policy of trying to achieve the right balance in guaranteeing the rights of members of minority groups to use their language, on one the hand, and ensuring universal knowledge of the state official language, on the other. It made recommendations.

70. The Russian Federation was concerned about systematic violations of the rights of the non-titular population to use and be educated in their language and to work, and about discrimination against non-citizens regarding their political and economic rights. It made recommendations.

71. Serbia encouraged Estonia to continue strengthening the independent human rights institutions and consult widely with civil society with regard to improving the Equal Treatment Act. It made recommendations.

72. Singapore welcomed measures to combat domestic violence and violence against women and underscored the importance of the implementation of initiatives such as paid paternity leave and an action plan to reduce the gender pay gap. Singapore made recommendations.

73. Slovakia commended Estonia for strengthening the legal and institutional framework on human rights and welcomed the adoption of acts on citizenship and child protection. It noted efforts to improve the protection of vulnerable groups and the integration of asylum seekers, and promote the quality of life of older persons. Slovakia made recommendations.

74. Slovenia commended initiatives concerning the right to participate in public and political life, the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and its Optional Protocol and the simplification of naturalization requirements for several categories of people. It noted that the strict language requirements for employment in the public and private sectors could put ethnic minorities at a disadvantage. Slovenia made recommendations.

75. Spain highlighted the adoption of the Registered Partnership Act and the amendments made to the Citizenship Act, which had simplified many aspects of naturalization procedures for non-citizens. Spain made recommendations.

76. Sweden welcomed efforts to decrease the number of detainees in prisons and detention centres. New and modern prisons had been constructed. However, there was still room for improvement with regard to the conditions under which prisoners were held. Sweden made a recommendation.

77. Tajikistan welcomed efforts taken by Estonia to ensure the rights of children and older persons. It made recommendations.

78. The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia encouraged Estonia to intensify its efforts with regard to combating domestic violence and violence against women, including the adoption of amendments to the Penal Code to establish those acts as specific criminal offences. It requested information on the process of establishing a national human rights institution. It made a recommendation.

79. Turkey noted the amendments to the Citizenship Act that facilitated the acquisition of Estonian citizenship by stateless persons. It was concerned, however, about a growing tendency towards manifestations of racism, xenophobia and Islamophobia in Estonian society. Turkey made recommendations.

80. Ukraine commended the reform of the Penal Code, the adoption of the new strategy on integration, the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and its Optional Protocol, and the special care development plan. It praised the positive attitude of Estonia towards the social and cultural needs of national minorities, including the Ukrainian community. Ukraine encouraged Estonia to continue its efforts to become party to the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, among others.

81. The United Arab Emirates praised the establishment of the Gender Equality Council and measures to address the gender pay gap and promote gender equality in education. It expressed concern, however, about reports of religious and racial discrimination and Islamophobia. It made recommendations.

82. The United Kingdom welcomed progress made in implementing its recommendations to Estonia during the first review, including the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and legal recognition of same-sex partners. It encouraged the full implementation of the strategy on integration. It made recommendations.

83. The delegation stated that the 2015 amendments to the Constitution had lowered the minimum age for voting in local elections to 16 years. The Government was considering granting prisoners the right to participate in elections.

84. The use of electronic voting systems had reached 30 per cent during the 2015 elections. The "I-voting" system had been continually monitored and improved to ensure privacy and confidentiality. The confidentiality of personal data was protected by several security measures. Legal remedies were in place in the event of a breach of confidentiality in personal data management.

85. The delegation recalled that Estonia was one of the most active advocates of cybersecurity and that Estonia had launched a number of key initiatives related thereto. Estonia utilized technological solutions to protect personal data within the state information system. Over 150 inspections had been carried out by data protection inspectors in 2015 as a part of their mandate to oversee that data protection regulations were met. Additionally, the Government had conducted an in-depth analysis of existing legislation and its implementation in practice in order to improve further the level of protection of personal data in telecommunication. Estonia envisaged introducing a more effective distinction between different approaches and situations in which retained data might be used, narrowing the scope and laying down more tailor-made provisions for different areas, including criminal proceedings and national security.

86. The Constitution entitled everyone, including prisoners, to the right to judicial review in cases of human rights violations. In that regard, several improvements had been made to the work of the judiciary. The average duration of court proceedings had been

reduced in the previous three years. Members of the judiciary received training on the case law of the European Court of Human Rights. The 2015 amendments to the State Liability Act stipulated the provision of compensation for lengthy criminal procedures. Estonia had started to draft legal amendments to ensure compensation for delays in civil and administrative procedures.

87. In response to questions regarding the teaching of minority languages, the delegation stated that State-funded schools provided education in different languages in addition to the state official languages. Education in Russian was available in public and private schools at all levels. According to the legislation, if there were at least 10 people of the same nationality residing in a local municipality, they were entitled to education in their mother tongue.

88. While in primary education the school chose the language of instruction, in upper secondary education at least 60 per cent of the curriculum should be completed in Estonian. The purpose of that requirement was to facilitate enhancement of knowledge of Estonian among all members of the population and to ensure access by members of minority groups to higher education and the labour market, as well as effective integration in society. The transition to 60 per cent of teaching in the education system being in Estonian had been carried out gradually between 2007 and 2014.

89. State exams and self-assessments by schools indicated that academic achievement had not been diminished as a result of that change and knowledge of Estonian had improved. Six of the fifteen highest-ranking schools were schools with education in Russian. Additionally, half of the schools using Russian had joined the language immersion programme, ensuring that students of those schools would have a good command of Estonian, Russian and English. The programme had also been proven effective for the children of migrants and refugees.

90. Estonia also provided support to adults to learn Estonian by reimbursing the cost of language courses for those who successfully passed language tests. The State provided free language courses for employees in the public sector, long-term residents and newly arrived migrants. As for the requirements for language proficiency in certain positions, the delegation emphasized that the requirements had been put in place to ensure the provision of public services and information in Estonian. The language requirement was also in accordance with the particular nature of the work. For example, the required proficiency for doctors or pharmacists was higher than for service staff.

91. The delegation confirmed that the punitive role of the Estonian language inspectorate had considerably decreased. The requirement to impose fines had been eliminated for several categories in January 2015. Insufficient command of the state language was no longer an administrative offence. Language inspectors should allow a realistic amount of time to enhance the language skills of an employee. Inspectors had demonstrated more flexibility and had often provided practical solutions in specific cases to ensure that services were provided in Estonian.

92. The new integration strategy focused on socioeconomic, educational, cultural and political integration. Integration was seen as a two-way process, influencing the society as a whole. The cultural advisory council of national minorities had been established in 2008 with the objective of presenting the interests of minority groups in decision-making. The Council promoted the cultural life and activities of national minorities and participated in implementing integration policy.

93. In 2015, the Minister of Culture had established the National Roma Integration Council, which involved different ministries and local governments, representatives of Roma organizations and experts. The aim of the Council was to encourage and facilitate

dialogue, promote cooperation and provide an opportunity to hold discussions related to questions on the integration of the Roma.

94. Unemployment rates among Estonians and non-Estonians had decreased in recent years. Discrepancies in unemployment rates between Estonian and ethnic minorities had also decreased in 2015. The Government paid special attention to the development of Ida-Virumaa, where the Russian-speaking minority comprised the majority of the population. The Estonian regional development strategy and the Ida-Viru county action plan for the period 2015-2020 foresaw measures to improve living conditions, strengthen civil society and promote economic and employment opportunities.

95. The United States of America urged Estonia to take further steps to counter prejudice and discrimination against lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons, migrants, asylum seekers, refugees and members of ethnic and religious minorities. It commended Estonia for its continued efforts to promote a tolerant and integrated society. The United States made recommendations.

96. Uruguay emphasized the accession by Estonia to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and its Optional Protocol, and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict. It took note of the efforts made by Estonia to establish a national human rights institution in accordance with the Paris Principles. Uruguay made recommendations.

97. Uzbekistan noted with satisfaction efforts taken to strengthen the legal and institutional framework for the protection and promotion of human rights. It noted concerns expressed about cases of discrimination against minorities, migrants and refugees, hate speech and gender discrimination. Uzbekistan made recommendations.

98. Afghanistan acknowledged the reform of the Penal Code and all measures taken to combat all forms of violence. It noted with appreciation the general education programme for the period 2016–2019 that included human rights education. Afghanistan made a recommendation.

99. Albania commended the Government for the welfare development plan for the period 2016-2023 and for adopting a new development plan to prevent violence. It encouraged Estonia to make further improvements in human rights. Albania made recommendations.

100. Algeria welcomed the positive steps taken by Estonia to improve the human rights situation since its first review. It noted with satisfaction the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, as had been recommended by Algeria and many other delegations in the previous review. Algeria made recommendations.

101. Argentina noted with satisfaction the efforts taken by the Government concerning education and congratulated Estonia for incorporating human rights in primary education curricula. It stated that challenges persisted, especially in relation to minority groups. Argentina made recommendations.

102. Armenia highlighted the new project to enhance communication and mutual understanding between young people and was pleased that the new strategy on integration and social cohesion addressed issues of integration. Armenia made recommendations.

103. Australia commended Estonia for implementing reforms to which it had committed during the review in 2011, including the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and its Optional Protocol, and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict. It commended the adoption of the Co-habitation Act, which extended the rights of married

couples to unmarried persons, including same-sex couples. Australia made recommendations.

104. Azerbaijan noted that some United Nations treaty bodies had expressed concern about problems related to discrimination, xenophobia and racist attitudes, as well as torture, ill-treatment and excessive use of force. Azerbaijan made recommendations.

105. Bahrain applauded the efforts made by Estonia in implementing recommendations of its first review. However, it remained concerned that there was no amendment to the Criminal Code prohibiting racist organizations and the dissemination of ideas that promote racial supremacy and racial hatred. Bahrain made recommendations.

106. Belarus noted measures taken to improve the situation of minorities. It noted discrimination in education and employment owing to restrictive measures taken to promote the state language. It called on Estonia to eliminate those restrictions. Belarus noted stigmatization of minorities and hate speech by politicians. It made recommendations.

107. Belgium offered congratulations on the adoption of an action plan to implement Security Council resolution 1325 (2000) and the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict. Nevertheless, Belgium underscored efforts still to be made in the area of combating all forms of discrimination and racism. Belgium made recommendations.

108. Botswana applauded efforts by Estonia in the fight against impunity and commended the ratification of the Kampala Amendments to the Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court, and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the involvement of children in armed conflict. It remained concerned, however, about reports of continued stigmatization of certain national minority groups. It made recommendations.

109. Brazil was concerned about incidents of possible disrespect of the principle of non-refoulement; the electronic communications act, which set the conditions for service providers to provide data to government agencies; and amendments to the Citizenship Law that might not cover children between 15 and 18 years of age. It urged Estonia to ratify the two conventions on statelessness. Brazil made recommendations.

110. Bulgaria noted that since the first review in 2011 Estonia had become party to several international human rights instruments, without making any reservations. It appreciated the creation of the position of the Ombudsman for Children and the establishment of the Gender Equality Council. Bulgaria made recommendations.

111. Burundi noted with satisfaction various measures taken by Estonia to protect gender equality. It commended the adoption of the Child Protection Act and the establishment of the Ombudsman for Children. It noted with appreciation different measures taken to improve the human rights of older persons. Burundi made a recommendation.

112. Canada commended Estonia for the ratification of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities. It encouraged the full implementation of the Registered Partnership Act. It noted the passage of amendments to the Citizenship Act that granted citizenship to children 15 years old and younger born to stateless parents and simplified language requirements for older persons. Canada made recommendations.

113. Chile underscored efforts by Estonia to reinforce its legal and institutional framework and adopt national human rights programmes such as a national plan to prevent violence against women, the Child Protection Act and amendments to the Penal Code to address trafficking in persons. Chile made recommendations.

114. Malaysia noted the adoption of the Child Protection Act and a plan for the period 2015-2010 on preventing violence, and the creation of the Ombudsman for Children. It noted that its recommendations of the first review had been accepted by Estonia. Malaysia made recommendations.

115. Costa Rica highlighted the incorporation of human rights education in the curriculum and appreciated efforts to improve legislation to combat torture. It expressed concern at the persistence of gender violence and sexual abuses, as well as the continuing gender pay gap. Costa Rica made recommendations.

116. Croatia commended the adoption of the new Child Protection Act and further strengthening of protection of the rights of the child. It was pleased that Estonia had fulfilled its commitment to enact a new law explicitly prohibiting corporal punishment. Croatia made recommendations.

117. Cuba highlighted the efforts made by Estonia in improving its gender equality indicators and the rights of women. It noted that several United Nations treaty bodies, and regional and non-governmental organizations, had expressed their concerns over continuing economic inequality, high unemployment rates and discrimination in employment affecting ethnic minorities. Cuba made recommendations.

118. The Czech Republic made recommendations.

119. Djibouti applauded the efforts of Estonia to implement recommendations from the first review. It was pleased with the decision to incorporate human rights in the school curriculum. It called upon Estonia to redouble its efforts to promote and protect human rights. Djibouti made recommendations.

120. In conclusion, the delegation expressed its gratitude to all States that had contributed to the discussion during the interactive dialogue. All comments and recommendations would be given due consideration by the Government, and recommendations accepted by Estonia would be thoroughly implemented. The follow-up to the review would become an essential part of the work of national institutions involved in the protection of human rights.

121. The delegation reaffirmed the commitment of Estonia to continue promoting and protecting human rights and stated that the universal periodic review mechanism remained a useful part of that work. As part of the follow-up to the review, Estonia would continue its efforts to become a party to the remaining international human rights instruments, including the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence and the Convention against Discrimination in Education. Estonia would adopt and implement a development and action plan in the areas of employment, social protection, inclusion, gender equality and equal opportunities for the period 2016–2023.

II. Conclusions and/or recommendations[**]

122. **The recommendations formulated during the interactive dialogue and listed below have been examined by Estonia and enjoy the support of Estonia:**

122.1 **Sign and ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (Turkey);**

[**] The conclusions and recommendations have not been edited.

122.2 **Step up its efforts to ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia);**

122.3 **Ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Argentina);**

122.4 **Sign and ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Oman);**

122.5 **Take necessary steps to ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Slovakia);**

122.6 **Consider ratifying the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Uruguay);**

122.7 **Ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance and the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (Portugal);**

122.8 **Consider ratifying the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women and the Convention against Discrimination in Education (Ghana);**

122.9 **Ratify the Convention against Discrimination in Education (Uzbekistan);**

122.10 **Consider ratifying the Convention against Discrimination in Education (Republic of Korea);**

122.11 **Accept and ratify the Convention against Discrimination in Education (Afghanistan);**

122.12 **Prioritize the ratification of the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence and of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (Italy);**

122.13 **Ratify the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (Montenegro);**

122.14 **Complete the ratification process of the Council of Europe's "Istanbul Convention" (Turkey);**

122.15 **Establish a national human rights institution (Iraq) (Algeria);**

122.16 **Establish a national human rights institution compliant with the Paris Principles (Hungary);**

122.17 **Establish a national human rights institution in full compliance with the Paris Principles (Australia);**

122.18 **Establish a national institution for protection of human rights in conformity with the Paris Principles (Burundi);**

122.19 **Establish a national human rights institution in conformity with the Paris Principles (Djibouti);**

122.20 **Establish a national human rights institution in accordance with the Paris Principles (Pakistan) (Poland) (Azerbaijan);**

122.21 **Establish a national institution for the protection of human rights in accordance with the Paris Principles (Bulgaria) (Portugal);**

122.22 **Establish or designate a national human rights institution compliant with the Paris Principles (Namibia);**

122.23 **Establish a national human rights institution (Oman);**

122.24 **Continue consideration of the establishment of a national human rights institution compliant with the Paris Principles (Georgia);**

122.25 **Consider establishing a national human rights institution in compliance with the Paris Principles (Republic of Korea);**

122.26 **Continue its efforts to establish a national human rights institution, in line with the Paris Principles and with the full participation of civil society (Indonesia);**

122.27 **Continue efforts to create a national human rights institution (Libya);**

122.28 **Establish as soon as possible a national human rights institution in accordance with the Paris Principles (Egypt);**

122.29 **Expedite establishment of a national human rights institution in accordance with Paris Principles (Latvia);**

122.30 **Expedite the process of establishing an independent and effective national human rights institution with a broad human rights mandate, in accordance with the Paris Principles (Ireland);**

122.31 **Take concrete steps towards the establishment of a national human rights institution in accordance with the Paris Principles (Malaysia);**

122.32 **Ensure that the Ombudsman enjoys full autonomy in accordance with the Paris Principle (Nicaragua);**

122.33 **Spare no efforts for the necessary establishment of a national human rights institution (Dominican Republic);**

122.34 **Accelerate the creation of a completely independent and sufficiently funded body with the capacity to defend human rights in Estonia, such as a national human rights institution (Costa Rica);**

122.35 **Further raise public awareness about the content of the new legislation and profile of the Ombudsman, in cooperation with NGOs, and in the education system raise awareness of children's rights, especially in cases of abuse and children's participation in civil and criminal proceedings (Lithuania);**

122.36 **Provide the Gender Equality Commissioner with sufficient resources to enable the institution to fulfil its mandate effectively and independently (Namibia);**

122.37 **Ensure the functioning of the Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner by providing sufficient resources for this institution (France);**

122.38 **Create an independent mechanism in charge of monitoring the implementation of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (France);**

122.39 **Continue conducting policy programmes to support the effective implementation of the new Child Protection Act, in particular focusing on prevention and early intervention in cases of child abuse and domestic violence (Finland);**

122.40 **Continue reinforcing its efforts to protect children's rights (Georgia);**

122.41 **Continue to adopt measures in order to ensure the protection of the rights of the child (Romania);**

122.42 **Continue to implement Child Protection Act (Pakistan);**

122.43 **Adopt and fully implement the Welfare and Development Plan 2016-2023, in accordance with the commitment set out in paragraph 143 of its national report (Panama);**

122.44 **Engage civil society in the follow-up implementation process of the universal periodic review recommendations (Poland);**

122.45 **Improve the submission of reports to the treaty bodies and strengthen its capacity-building in this sphere (China);**

122.46 **Continue to adopt measures in order to ensure the creation of a comprehensive anti-discrimination framework (Romania);**

122.47 **Allocate necessary resources to strengthen gender equality (Bahrain);**

122.48 **Operationalize/enforce legal mechanisms on ensuring gender equality (Tajikistan);**

122.49 **Continue efforts made towards the promotion of a culture of gender equality in society through awareness-raising campaigns (Morocco);**

122.50 **Address the gender pay gap for work of equal value (Egypt);**

122.51 **Take further measures aimed at achieving equal remuneration for men and women for the same work (Oman);**

122.52 **Provide more opportunities to women in the labour market (Oman);**

122.53 **Take measures, while fully respecting freedom of expression, to curtail stereotyping of minorities, particularly the Muslim community in the society (Iran (Islamic Republic of));**

122.54 **Adopt measures to restrict the use of stereotypes towards minorities in the media and to promote the use of minority languages in the mass media and the press (Cuba);**

122.55 **Take necessary measures against discrimination based on ethnic and religious origin and language in employment and prosecute such cases (Iran (Islamic Republic of));**

122.56 **Condemn discrimination based on ethnic origin and language in employment and take active measures to prosecute such cases (Slovenia);**

122.57 **Step up efforts to tackle the socioeconomic gap and discrimination on the basis of ethnic origin, race or language, especially with regard to education and employment (Republic of Korea);**

122.58 **Prosecute cases of discrimination based on ethnic origin and language in employment (Iceland);**

122.59 **Promote equal opportunities for ethnic and national minorities, in particular in the area of education, vocational training and employment (Uzbekistan);**

122.60 **Combat discrimination on account of nationality, ethnic or religious affiliation, and sexual orientation or gender identity (United States of America);**

122.61 **Continue efforts on the legislative front to combat incitement to hatred, violence and racial discrimination on the grounds of nationality, ethnicity, language, colour, religion or any other grounds, and address different existing challenges and concerns in this regard (Libya);**

122.62 **Continue legislative efforts to combat public incitement to racial discrimination and particularly against persons speaking other languages (Mexico);**

122.63 **Deepen awareness measures against racial discrimination and xenophobia, particularly by criminalizing behaviors such as incitement to hatred (Argentina);**

122.64 **Strengthen laws prohibiting religious and racial discrimination and criminalizing hate speech and incitement to religious and racial hatred (United Arab Emirates);**

122.65 **Take concrete measures to curb incitement to hatred, violence and discrimination through the enactment of legislation, as well as policies and programmes that promote tolerance and intercultural, interracial and interreligious understanding (Malaysia);**

122.66 **Develop effective measures to eradicate racism and xenophobia, including hate speech (Botswana);**

122.67 **Prevent and combat xenophobic statements and acts targeting migrants, asylum seekers and refugees (Azerbaijan);**

122.68 **Strengthen the Penal Code as an effective instrument in combating hate speech (Norway);**

122.69 **Classify hate speech with racist content and incitement to hatred as crimes punishable under criminal law (Russian Federation);**

122.70 **Enact laws and take appropriate measures in order to criminalize hate speech (Oman);**

122.71 **Pursue "hate speech" offences more vigorously by not only condemning violations but also investigating, prosecuting and punishing violators in a consistent manner (Germany);**

122.72 **Amend the Criminal Code so that it explicitly provides sanctions against organizations propagating racist ideas as well as hate speech (Belgium);**

122.73 **Implement their "Diversity Enriches" programme to promote inclusion, tolerance and integration of people from different backgrounds, nationalities, religions, genders and sexual orientations (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);**

122.74 **Launch a debate on issues concerning ethnic and cultural diversity aiming at promoting tolerance towards divergent cultural, religious and sexual orientations within the Estonian society (Germany);**

122.75 **Take further steps to promote tolerance, cultural diversity and integration in the country and internationally (Armenia);**

122.76 **Establish measures to promote tolerance of ethnic and religious diversity in society (United States of America);**

122.77 **Develop and implement public awareness campaigns and education programmes to promote diversity and inclusion, while combating racism and xenophobia (Canada);**

122.78 **Reform its education and training programmes, including those for the media and security officials, so that these programmes contribute more to the promotion of tolerance among nationalities and ethnic and religious groups (Belgium);**

122.79 **Revise its legislation and legal practice to ensure that sexual orientation and gender identity as motivation for criminal offence are treated as aggravating circumstances (Finland);**

122.80 **Develop and adopt legislation that would recognize explicitly hatred on the basis of sexual orientation and gender identity as a motive and make it an aggravated circumstance in a crime (Bulgaria);**

122.81 **Develop and adopt legislation that would explicitly recognize hatred on the basis of sexual orientation and gender identity as a motive and make it an aggravated circumstance in a crime (Slovenia);**

122.82 **Thoroughly investigate and prosecute all acts of violence against ethnic and racial minorities and vulnerable groups, including lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons, and enact legislation on hate crimes based on sexual orientation or gender identity (Canada);**

122.83 **Amend the Penal Code to include a definition of torture in conformity with the Convention against Torture and conduct independent and prompt investigation of all claims of torture and ill-treatment (Egypt);**

122.84 **Investigate all allegations of torture, ill-treatment and excessive use of force by law enforcement officials and bring those responsible to justice (Azerbaijan);**

122.85 **Strengthen the Criminal Code and structures established to fight against violence and discrimination against women, in particular the Office of the Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner (Belgium);**

122.86 **Combat more vigorously the phenomenon of domestic violence, in particular violence against children, including by the introduction of a coherent and clear legislative framework prohibiting corporal punishment (Hungary);**

122.87 **Continue its good efforts to address violence against women and domestic violence, in particular through the ratification of the Council of Europe Convention on Preventing and Combating Violence against Women and Domestic Violence (Latvia);**

122.88 **Continue to prioritize efforts to prevent and tackle violence against women, and work with relevant stakeholders to strengthen the national victim support system (Singapore);**

122.89 **Undertake the necessary legislative measures to criminalize domestic violence (Panama);**

122.90 **Strengthen prevention efforts, including through legislative measures aimed against domestic violence and ensure that all professionals working with victims of domestic violence receive regular and comprehensive training (Czech Republic);**

122.91 **Increase efforts to prevent and sanction gender violence and sexual abuse (Costa Rica);**

122.92 **Reinforce mechanisms to detect and investigate cases of domestic violence, train law enforcement officials to deal with such cases and fully implement the provisions of the National Plan for Preventing Violence for the period 2015–2020 (Republic of Moldova);**

122.93 **Adequate financing of the new gender equality institution, promotion of its role through public awareness campaigns, and improvement in data collection on gender equality, domestic violence and violence against women and children (Lithuania);**

122.94 **Further promote large-scale awareness raising campaigns to prevent and combat violence against women and domestic violence (Italy);**

122.95 **Continue public information campaigns to combat domestic violence, and above all violence against women (Mexico);**

122.96 **Take necessary measures to prevent possible cases of corporal punishment against children in the home and in all other settings (Mexico);**

122.97 **Continue with efforts to prevent violence against children at schools and other institutions where children are present, to ensure that children are aware of their right to be protected from all forms of violence and of the assistance provided if they are victims of violence (Croatia);**

122.98 **Reinforce measures to combat human trafficking (Azerbaijan);**

122.99 **Fight against trafficking in human beings (Djibouti);**

122.100 **Take further measures to prevent human trafficking, strengthen the protection of victims and provide them with redress (Serbia);**

122.101 **Take effective measures to prevent and investigate cases of human trafficking for forced prostitution and forced labor (Russian Federation);**

122.102 **Increase efforts to investigate, prosecute and convict trafficking offenders under article 133 of the Penal Code (United States of America);**

122.103 **Take further measures to prevent trafficking in persons in investigating and prosecuting offenders and provide effective support and redress to victims, as well as step up efforts to raise awareness about human trafficking (United Arab Emirates);**

122.104 **Make efforts taken in the field of measures to improve access to justice (Iraq);**

122.105 **Ensure that all persons detained by the police are fully informed of their fundamental rights from the very outset of their deprivation of liberty (Islamic Republic of Iran);**

122.106 **Continue the efforts to reduce overcrowding and take action to improve the general conditions in prisons and detention centres (Sweden);**

122.107 **Continue working to improve detention conditions and to address the problem of overcrowding in prisons (Georgia);**

122.108 Redouble its efforts to develop the Welfare Development Plan 2016-2023, with particular emphasis on the protection and promotion of the rights of older persons (Singapore);

122.109 Promote access to education, especially for minorities (Dominican Republic);

122.110 Continue to work on programmes to motivate and promote education for young people (Nicaragua);

122.111 Combat school dropouts and increase the number of students who finish secondary education (Bahrain);

122.112 Adopt measures targeted to remedy school dropouts (Djibouti);

122.113 Introduce programmes and projects within the concept of human rights education on the prevention of genocide, war crimes and crimes against humanity (Armenia);

122.114 Promote the realization of the right of everyone to take part in cultural life, including by ensuring the facilitation of access to cultural goods, particularly for disadvantaged and marginalized individuals and groups (Albania);

122.115 Increase the number of measures for persons with disabilities to obtain appropriate jobs (Bahrain);

122.116 Prepare, in consultation with persons with disabilities, a national strategy for the promotion and protection of rights of persons with disabilities, in line with the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, and strengthen measures protecting persons with disabilities against discrimination, including through strengthening the Equal Treatment Act in this regard (Czech Republic);

122.117 Continue efforts in combating discrimination against persons belonging to a Russian-speaking minority (France);

122.118 Grant access to quality education for Roma children in mainstream schools (Portugal);

122.119 Assess the overall situation of the Roma community and adopt a comprehensive strategy to tackle discrimination and other problems faced by that community (Albania);

122.120 Intensify efforts to address the disadvantages faced by minority groups with regard to employment and remuneration based on language proficiency (Norway);

122.121 Expand mechanisms aimed at ensuring consultation with people belonging to national minorities and that the representatives of these minorities participate effectively in making decisions that affect them (Cuba);

122.122 Continue strengthening the integration programmes of national minorities to ensure their economic, social and cultural rights (Chile);

122.123 Continue its efforts in providing migrants and other sectors in vulnerable situations greater access to health, education and other social services, in the face of an increased number of migrants entering Europe (Philippines);

122.124 **Work actively to reduce the number of stateless residents in the country (Iceland);**

122.125 **Continue efforts to reduce statelessness and to facilitate access to citizenship for long-term residents in Estonia (Norway);**

122.126 **Further strengthen its norms, in conformity with the provisions of the Refugee Conventions, including procedures for asylum request, non-refoulement and access to legal advice, among others (Chile).**

123. **The following recommendations will be examined by Estonia, which will provide responses in due time, but no later than the thirty-second session of the Human Rights Council in June 2016:**

123.1 **Ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on a communications procedure (Montenegro) (France) (Czech Republic) (Portugal);**

123.2 **Consider the ratification of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on a communications procedure (Slovakia);**

123.3 **Ratify the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (France) (Spain) (Portugal);**

123.4 **Consider ratifying the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Ghana);**

123.5 **Ratify without reservations the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and opt in to the inquiry and inter-State procedures (Bulgaria);**

123.6 **Ratify the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance and recognize the competence of the Committee on Enforced Disappearances (in accordance with articles 31 and 32 of this instrument) (France);**

123.7 **Ratify the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Egypt) (Azerbaijan);**

123.8 **Ratify the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families , as previously recommended (Algeria);**

123.9 **Sign and ratify the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Turkey);**

123.10 **Consider the ratification of the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Indonesia);**

123.11 **Move towards the ratification of the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Chile);**

123.12 **Consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families and International Labour Organization Convention No. 189 (Philippines);**

123.13 **Ratify, among other international instruments, the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, the Convention relating to the Status of Stateless**

Persons and the Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, and continue its efforts to legalize the situation of persons with "undetermined nationality", guaranteeing their right to nationality (Ecuador);

123.14 **Consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Ghana) (Uruguay);**

123.15 **Consider ratifying the Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons of 1954 and the Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness of 1961 (Uruguay);**

123.16 **Accede to the Convention Relating to the Status of Stateless Persons 1954 and the Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness 1961, and ensure that language requirements relating to employment are implemented in a fair and objective manner and that the rights of ethnic and linguistic minorities are actively promoted and protected (Ireland);**

123.17 **Ratify the Convention relating to the Status of Stateless Persons (1954) and the Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness (1961) (Panama) (Australia);**

123.18 **Ratify the 1954 Convention on the Status of Stateless Persons (Spain);**

123.19 **Consider ratifying the 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness (Croatia);**

123.20 **Continue efforts towards ratification of international conventions (Morocco);**

123.21 **Step up its efforts towards the ratification of other international human rights treaties that it is not yet a state party (Philippines);**

123.22 **Continue efforts for the creation of a national human rights institution, in accordance with international standards, which contributes to the preparation of an action plan on social welfare, ensuring the inclusion and equal opportunities for all the population, with special attention to minorities (Ecuador);**

123.23 **Establish a body (ombudsman, commissioner or the like) as a prominent institution to protect the rights of minorities and immigrants (Germany);**

123.24 **Establish a post of an Ombudsman on the issues of national minorities, as recommended previously (Russian Federation);**

123.25 **Increase the resources allocated to the Gender Equality and Equal Treatment Commissioner as a matter of priority (Norway);**

123.26 **Adopt a national action plan to implement the United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights (Netherlands);**

123.27 **Develop National Human Rights Indicators as suggested by OHCHR, as an instrument that allows for a more precise and coherent evaluation of its national human rights policies (Portugal);**

123.28 **Stop discrimination in the area of employment on the grounds of ethnic origin and language and adopt active measures to prosecute such cases in the courts (Russian Federation);**

123.29 **Support fully to the adoption of the necessary information-educational measures to promote racial, ethnic and religious tolerance, with the emphasis on those characteristics that are results of natural-historical development (Tajikistan);**

123.30 **Develop a holistic strategy to allow combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and other related forms of intolerance (Panama);**

123.31 **Initiate a comprehensive strategy to address manifestation of racism, xenophobia and Islamophobia, especially in view to preventing xenophobic acts (Turkey);**

123.32 **Ban organizations that encourage and incite racial discrimination (Uzbekistan);**

123.33 **Ban organizations which promote and instigate racial discrimination and hatred (Russian Federation);**

123.34 **Amend the Criminal Code to prohibit racist organizations and establish criminal liability for hate speech with racist content and incitement to hatred (Belarus);**

123.35 **Stop the participation of members of the Estonian armed forces in annual so called remembrance events glorifying the former legionaries of "Waffen SS" and Nazi collaborators (Russian Federation);**

123.36 **Review the discriminatory linguistic policy, including the work of the Language Inspectorates whose targets are mainly teachers of Russian language schools and kindergartens (Russian Federation);**

123.37 **Apply aggravating circumstance in hate-motivated crimes as well as prohibit and criminalize racist organizations, hate speech, incitement to hatred and the dissemination of ideas based on racial superiority and hatred (Egypt);**

123.38 **Legally recognize marriage between persons of the same sex (Spain);**

123.39 **Ensure the necessary legislation is passed to ensure the Registered Partnership Act comes into force (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);**

123.40 **Adopt the necessary implementation legislation for Registered Partnership Act and ensure its full implementation (Netherlands);**

123.41 **Build on efforts to address all forms of violence against women by enacting specific laws that prohibit domestic and sexual violence, including intimate partner violence, and by investigating all allegations of violence, prosecuting perpetrators, and ensuring victims are protected and have access to medical and legal services (Canada);**

123.42 **Adopt a new law to prohibit trafficking in human beings and increase protection granted to victims (Bahrain);**

123.43 **Respect the right to vote of all inmates (Canada);**

123.44 **Consider additional safeguards for minorities in the criminal justice system, namely to introduce guarantees with respect to the right to use a minority language in all stages of the criminal proceedings (Serbia);**

123.45 **Undertake a review of the communications surveillance laws, policies and practices with a view to upholding the right to privacy in line with international human rights law (Brazil);**

123.46 **Provide protection for the family as the natural and fundamental unit of the society (Egypt);**

123.47 **Take measures to ensure full participation of all groups of individuals in the political and public affairs of the country (Botswana);**

123.48 **Continue promoting and implementing its programs of social inclusion to make citizens' participation more active, and in particular the participation of minorities or excluded groups (Nicaragua);**

123.49 **Ensure equal representation of the titular and non-titular communities in local self-government bodies (Russian Federation);**

123.50 **Further guarantee the status and rights of national ethnic and linguistic minorities on the legislative and judicial front as well as in the policy front (China);**

123.51 **Provide the necessary status to languages of minorities and create conditions where minorities do not fear of discrimination (Belarus);**

123.52 **Fulfil its obligations under the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights so that the Russian-speaking linguistic minority fully enjoys the right to equal opportunities in the labour market (Iceland);**

123.53 **Continue improving reforms to legislation on citizenship and nationality, reducing the cost of procedures and by making the language test less demanding to the minimum indispensable (Uruguay);**

123.54 **Confer nationality to all stateless minor children, regardless of age or the condition or nationality of their parents (Spain);**

123.55 **Avoid detaining asylum seekers and ensure all asylum seekers the right to lodge asylum applications at border-crossing points and in transit zones (Brazil).**

124. **All conclusions and/or recommendations contained in the present report reflect the position of the submitting State(s) and/or the State under review. They should not be construed as endorsed by the Working Group as a whole.**

Annex

Composition of the delegation

The delegation of Estonia was headed by Minister of Foreign Affairs, Ms. Marina Kaljurand and composed of the following members:

- Mr. Andre Pung, Ambassador, Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of Estonia In Geneva;
- Ms. Riia Salsa, Deputy Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission of Estonia In Geneva;
- Ms. Merje Mägi, 3rd Secretary, Permanent Mission of Estonia in Geneva;
- Ms. Karmen Laus, Director of Second Division (International Organisations), Political Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs;
- Ms. Triinu Kallas, Director of International Law Division, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs;
- Mr. Jaanus Kirikmäe, Senior Counsellor, Second Division (International Organisations), Political Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs;
- Mr. Jürgo Loo, Counsellor, International Law Division, Legal Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs;
- Ms. Kai Härmand, Deputy Secretary General, Legislative Policy Department, Ministry of Justice;
- Ms. Kristel Siitam-Nyiri, Deputy Secretary General, Criminal Policy Department, Ministry of Justice;
- Ms. Anne-Ly Reimaa, Undersecretary (Cultural Diversity), Ministry of Culture;
- Ms. Mall Saul, Chief Specialist, Cultural Diversity Department, Ministry of Culture;
- Ms. Birgit Lüüs, Deputy Department Head For Migration, Citizenship And Migration Policy Department, Ministry Of The Interior;
- Ms. Siiri Leskov, Adviser, Citizenship and Migration Policy Department, Ministry of the Interior;
- Mr. Rait Kuuse, Deputy Secretary General on Social Policy, Ministry of Social Affairs;
- Ms. Helena Pall, Adviser, Equality Policies Department, Ministry of Social Affairs;
- Ms. Eha Lannes, Adviser, Social Welfare Department, Ministry of Social Affairs;
- Ms. Mariann Rikka, Chief Expert, General Education Department, Ministry of Education and Research.